Securing Sensitive Health Information in the U.S. Health Care System: Past, Present and Future

Doug Blough, Georgia Tech

In collaboration with: *M. Ahamad, L. Liu,* Georgia Tech and *J. Saltz, T. Kurc,* Emory

Graduate student contributors: *D. Bauer, J. Brown, D. Mashima, A. Mohan,* Georgia Tech







CS Research in Health IT

- Personal health or mobile health: home health devices and monitoring, applications to assist with personal health maintenance/improvement, social networking for health, etc.
- Health IT in the health system: softwarecontrolled medical devices in hospitals and doctor's offices, electronic health record (EHR) repositories and exchanges







Past: Closed Health Systems Architecture



- On-site access only no external connections allowed (only exception is pushing of billing info)
- Primary threat insider attack







Typical Security Model for Closed Systems

- No access control any health professional (doctor, nurse, technician) can see all records about all patients; tension between care, security
- Logging of all EHR accesses
- *"Random" auditing* is performed (in practice, auditing is typically performed on high profile patients or when a complaint has been filed)
- Training of all staff on policy EHR info to be accessed only for legitimate medical purposes
- Accountability serious consequences, up to and including dismissal, for policy breaches







Representative Incidents in Closed Systems

- Lost or stolen components: laptops, tapes, servers
 - In 2006, an Indiana man stole a server containing records of 900,000 patients and attempted to extort money from AIG by threatening to release the information on the Internet

• Human error

- From 1999-2005, Kaiser Permanente posted records of 150 patients on a misconfigured Web site accessible to the public
- In 2008, a contractor for Grady Hospital in Atlanta posted records of 45 patients on a public Web site for several weeks
- In 2007, records of 900,000 soldiers, govt. employees, and family members were posted on an SAIC server on the Internet







Representative Incidents, continued

- Deliberate internal breaches usually small-scale: curiosity, revenge, blackmail, divorce/custody disputes, etc.
 - In 2009, two Kaiser Permanente employees were fired, 16 resigned, and 9 were otherwise disciplined for accessing the records of Nadya Suleman and her children
 - In Jan. 2011, 3 clinical support staff and 1 nurse at Tucson Univ. Medical Center were fired for unauthorized accesses to records of Gabrielle Giffords and other shooting victims
 - No reliable statistics on this category, many cases likely go undetected







Present: Limited External Access



- Common patient uses: access to test results; communication with doctors, nurses; limited views of EHR info; prescription refills
- Currently, limited health information exchange, usually within a highly localized region and between systems from same vendor, is occurring







(Near) Future: Large-Scale Health Information Exchange (HIE)



Emerging Threat Examples

- Insider threat explosion: if closed system access model is extended to HIE, insiders will include most health care professionals in the US, public health officials, and many others
- Malware: in 2009, 300 Windows boxes controlling MRI machines in the US were found to be infected with the Conficker worm
- Monetization of stolen health information: in Oct.
 2010, the largest Medicare fraud in history, carried out by a large organized crime syndicate, was announced
 - identities of thousands of Medicare beneficiaries and licensed physicians were stolen
 - perpetrators used stolen info to bill Medicare for services never provided
 - \$163M in fraudulent billings through 118 phony clinics in 25 states







Examples of Security and Privacy Research Challenges

- Transparent situationally-aware access control
- Anomaly detection
- Provenance both for auditing and compliance
- Dynamic detection and resolution of policy conflicts
- Metadata privacy inference attacks
- Identity management: both users (health care professionals) and non-users (patients)
- E-consent
- Dealing with widely distributed health records and information authenticity
- Intrusion detection/tolerance, malware analysis and detection, etc.







MedVault Research Threads

- Transparent situationally-aware access
 control
- Verifiable and redactable health records
- Monitoring of health record accesses





Transparent situationally-aware access control

- Transparent situational awareness through collection of large number of trusted attributes, both static and dynamic
 "Attribute Trust", 2008 Int'l Conf on Privacy Security and Trust
- Adaptive policy-driven authorization mechanisms that adjust to current situational context and combine policies from multiple stakeholders patient, health care provider, regulatory agencies, HIE operator, etc.
 - "Dynamic policy conflict resolution", *IDTrust 2010*
 - "Detection of conflicts and inconsistencies in taxonomy-based policies", BIBM 2011







Verifiable and redactable health records

- Sources of health information sign records with a *redactable signature*
- Records are shared with another entity, e.g. patient or other provider
- Other entity can pass along records while *redacting sensitive information*
- Integrity of unredacted information and verifiability of sources are provided

Geordia 🖻

- "Multi-authority redactable signatures", DIM 2008
- "Redactable signatures with data disclosure dependencies", WPES 2009
- "Verifiable and redactable medical documents", to be submitted





Monitoring of health record accesses

- Monitoring of credential usage, e.g. to detect stolen physician's credentials, *DIM 2009*
- Monitoring health record accesses and reporting to patients how information is being used, *IHI* 2012









Current and Future Research

- BDD-based formal evaluation of policies consistency, completeness, safety, other security properties
- Detection of possible inference attack vulnerabilities through correlation analyses of sensitive and nonsensitive elements and analysis of policy inconsistencies
- Implementation and evaluation of attribute-based policydriven security in the Atlanta Clinical and Translational Sciences Institute Biomedical Information Exchange
- Security for cloud-based health services

http://medvault.gtisc.gatech.edu







Questions??





